

**Department of Human Services
Aged Care Land Bank
Cecil Street, South Melbourne**

Tectura P/L
Masterplan Option Assessment Matrix

**AGED CARE LAND BANK
CECIL STREET, SOUTH MELBOURNE
MASTERPLAN OPTION SUMMARY**

	Option 1	Option 2	Option 3	Option 4	Option 5	Option 6	Option 7
Issues							
No. Beds	3 storey 90 beds (30 on each floor)	3 storey 90 beds (30 on each floor)	2 storey 90 beds (45 on each floor)	3 storey 90 beds (30 on each floor)	2 storey 90 beds (45 on each floor)	2 storey 90 beds (45 on each floor)	2 storey 90 beds (45 on each floor)
No. Independent Living Units (ILU)	10, 4 to be refitted into existing single storey building on Raglan St; 6 to be refitted into existing 2 storey building on Napier St	10, 4 to be refitted into existing single storey building on Raglan St; 6 to be refitted into existing 2 storey building on Napier St	Nil	10, 4 to be refitted into existing single storey building on Raglan St; 6 to be refitted into existing 2 storey building on Napier St	6, all to be refitted into existing 2 storey building on Napier St	6, all to be refitted into existing 2 storey building on Napier St	6, all to be refitted into existing 2 storey building on Napier St
Effects on existing buildings on site	Existing 2 storey building on Napier St refurbished for ILUs; existing single storey building on Raglan St refurbished for ILUs; existing 2 storey building on Raglan St refurbished for cook fresh kitchen	Existing 2 storey building on Napier St refurbished for ILUs; existing single storey building on Raglan St refurbished for ILUs; existing 2 storey building on Raglan St refurbished for cook fresh kitchen	Existing 2 storey building on Napier St refurbished with cook fresh kitchen and other amenities; existing buildings on Raglan St demolished, bulk of facades to be retained	Existing 2 storey building on Napier St refurbished for ILUs. Existing 2 storey building on Raglan St refurbished with cook fresh kitchen; existing single storey building on Raglan St to be refurbished for 4 ILUs	Existing 2 storey building on Napier St refurbished for ILUs; existing 2 storey building on Raglan St refurbished for cook fresh kitchen & amenities; existing single storey building on Raglan St refurbished for amenities	Existing 2 storey building on Napier St refurbished for ILUs; existing 2 storey building on Raglan St refurbished for cook fresh kitchen; existing single storey building on Raglan St refurbished for amenities	Existing 2 storey building on Napier St refurbished for ILUs; existing 2 storey building on Raglan St refurbished for cook fresh kitchen & amenities; existing single storey building on Raglan St refurbished for amenities
Effects on existing trees on site	All retained	All removed	All removed	All removed	3 largest trees retained, the remaining 3 removed	All removed	All removed
Entry/Drop off point	Main entry & drop off zone via proposed new easement	Main entry & drop off zone via proposed new easement	Main entry via Church St; No drop off zone	Visitor entry & drop off zone via Church St; Rear entry for staff	Visitor entry & drop off zone via Church St; Rear entry for staff	Visitor entry & drop off zone via Church St; Rear entry for staff	Visitor entry & drop off zone via Church St; Rear entry for staff
Carparking (30 required*)	8 on site parking accessed via proposed new easement, street parking may be utilised	6 on site parking accessed via proposed new easement, street parking may be utilised	No on site, street parking may be utilised	4 on site parking accessed via proposed new easement, street parking may be utilised	8 on site parking accessed via proposed new easement, street parking may be utilised	8 on site parking accessed via proposed new easement, street parking may be utilised	8 on site parking accessed via proposed new easement, street parking may be utilised
Privacy	Church Street frontage is too close to the footpath (overlooking issue)	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians. ILUs on Napier St abutting Aged Care building not ideal	Extensive façade on the line of boundary on Church St, major privacy issue from pedestrians	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians
Outdoor space	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view
Overshadowing	3 storey Aged Care building will potentially overshadow the 4 ILUs on the southern side of the site	3 storey Aged Care building will potentially overshadow the 4 ILUs on the southern side of the site	Courtyards might not get direct sunlight due to 3 storey wall around	3 storey Aged Care building will potentially overshadow the 4 ILUs on the southern side of the site	No major overshadowing	No major overshadowing	No major overshadowing
Efficiency of Aged Care layout	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward	Acceptable, relatively centralised amenities feed into each ward, however distance from staff base to end of ward is quite far	Ineffective, decentralised amenity spaces and wards create a potentially difficult space to monitor from staff base	Ineffective, amenities space being decentralised create a very difficult space to monitor from staff base due to the great distance to travel to end of wards	Ineffective, amenities space being decentralised create a very difficult space to monitor from staff base due to the great distance to travel to end of wards	Ineffective, amenities space being decentralised create a very difficult space to monitor from staff base due to the great distance to travel to end of wards

*The below carparking information is approximate and needs to be verified with the City of Port Phillip Town Planning Permit requirements and process

Carparking: All subject to City of Port Phillip Planning Permit Application. City of Port Phillip Planning Scheme requirement is 1 car space per dwelling. Visitor carparking is unspecified.

Potentially 30 car parks required, however 0.6 cars per dwelling could be discussed which would result in 18 car spaces.

NOTE: These options are subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. Issues such as height controls, town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, need to be discussed with the City of Port Phillip.

**AGED CARE LAND BANK
CECIL STREET, SOUTH MELBOURNE
MASTERPLAN OPTION SUMMARY**

	Option 8	Option 9	Option 10	Option 11	Option 12	Option 13	Option 14
Issues							
No. Beds	3 storey 90 beds (30 on each floor)	3 storey 90 beds (30 on each floor)	2 storey 72 beds (36 on each floor)	2 storey 72 beds (36 on each floor)	2 storey 72 beds (36 on each floor)	2 storey 72 beds (36 on each floor)	3 storey 90 beds (30 on each floor)
No. Independent Living Units (ILU)	30, 6 to be refitted into existing building on Napier St, 24 to be located in new 4 storey building to the south of site	30, 6 to be refitted into existing building on Napier St, 24 to be located in new 4 storey building abutting to existing Napier St building	24, all to be located in new 4 storey building south of site	30, 6 to be refitted into existing building on Napier St, 24 to be located in new 4 storey building abutting existing Napier St building	30, 6 to be refitted into existing building on Napier St, 24 to be located in new 4 storey building to the south of site	30, 6 to be refitted into existing building on Napier St, 24 to be located in new 4 storey building to the east of site	24, 6 to be refitted into existing building on Napier St, 18 to be located in new 3 storey building to south of site
Effects on existing buildings on site	2 existing buildings on Raglan St removed	2 existing buildings on Raglan St demolished, bulk of facades to be retained	Existing 2 storey building on Napier St demolished; 2 existing buildings on Raglan St demolished	2 existing buildings on Raglan St demolished, bulk of facades to be retained	2 existing buildings on Raglan St removed	2 existing buildings on Raglan St demolished, bulk of facades to be retained	2 existing buildings on Raglan St removed
Effects on existing trees on site	All removed	All removed	All removed	All removed	All removed	All removed	All removed
Entry/Drop off point	Main entry & drop off zone via proposed new easement; delivery zone off Church St	Main entry & drop off zone via Raglan St; delivery zone off Church St	Main entry & drop off zone via proposed new easement; delivery zone off Church St	Main entry & drop off zone via Raglan St; delivery zone off Church St	Main entry & drop off zone via proposed new easement; delivery zone off Church St	Main entry, drop off zone and delivery zone via proposed new easement	Main entry & drop off zone via proposed new easement; delivery zone off Church St
Carparking (30 required*)	None on site, street parking may be utilised	None on site, street parking may be utilised	10 on site parking accessed via proposed new easement, street parking may be utilised	None on site, street parking may be utilised	None on site, street parking may be utilised	None on site, street parking may be utilised	30 on the undercroft space of new 3 storey building to south of site housing 18 ILUs
Privacy	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians	Extensive façade on the line of boundary on Napier St, major privacy issue from pedestrians	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians; facade facing proposed new easement may face privacy issue with passing cars	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians	Reasonable setback from all street fronts, minimal privacy issue from pedestrians
Outdoor space	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view	Abundant outdoor space enables each bedroom window access to natural light and view
Overshadowing	3 storey Aged Care building will potentially overshadow the lower levels of the 4 storey ILU building on the southern side of the site	4 storey ILU building on the northern side of the site will potentially overshadow parts of the Aged Care building	3 storey Aged Care building will potentially overshadow the lower levels of the 4 storey ILU building on the southern side of the site	4 storey ILU building on the northern side of the site will potentially overshadow parts of the Aged Care building	3 storey Aged Care building will potentially overshadow the lower levels of the 4 storey ILU building on the southern side of site	4 storey ILU building on the eastern side of site will potentially overshadow the Aged Care building to the west	No major overshadowing
Efficiency of Aged Care layout	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward	Good, centralised amenities feed into each ward, relatively short distance from staff base to end of ward

***The below carparking information is approximate and needs to be verified with the City of Port Phillip Town Planning Permit requirements and process**

Carparking: All subject to City of Port Phillip Planning Permit Application. City of Port Phillip Planning Scheme requirement is 1 car space per dwelling. Visitor carparking is unspecified.

Potentially 30 car parks required, however 0.6 cars per dwelling could be discussed which would result in 18 car spaces.

NOTE: These options are subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. Issues such as height controls, town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, need to be discussed with the City of Port Phillip.