

TECTURA

**DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN SERVICES
AGED CARE LAND BANK, CECIL STREET, SOUTH MELBOURNE
FEASIBILITY STUDY FINAL REPORT
REVISION 01 - 18th May 2009**

Contents

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	4
Introduction	4
2. FEASIBILITY STUDY OVERVIEW	5
Service Plan	5
Consultation	5
Briefed Requirements and Accommodation Area Schedules	5
Residential Aged Care:	5
The Site, Town Planning Requirements & Permits	6
Master Plan Development Options	7
Four Feasibility Study Development Options	7
Programme	8
3. SITE CONDITIONS.....	8
The Site.....	8
Proposed New Easement.....	8
Site Heritage Overlay, Conservation Management Plan and Heritage Victoria	9
Existing Buildings Conditions.....	9
Asbestos and Hazardous Materials Survey and Risk Assessment.....	9
Soil Conditions/ Contamination.....	10
Town Planning	11
Regulatory Requirements	13
4. FOUR FEASIBILITY DEVELOPMENT OPTIONS DESCRIPTION	13
5. FOURTEEN MASTER PLAN DEVELOPMENT OPTIONS.....	16
6. AUTHORITIES	25
<i>Regulatory Issues</i>	25
7. ENVIRONMENTALLY SUSTAINABLE DESIGN.....	26
<i>Energy and Environmental Objectives</i>	26
8. APPENDICES.....	26
Heritage Architects Report prepared by HLCD Heritage Architects	
Existing Conditions Site/Ground Floor Plan, prepared by Tectura P/L	
Existing Site Conditions Photos, prepared by Tectura P/L	
Draft Title Plan for Cecil Street Site	
Feasibility Study Development Options: Proposed Demolition Site Plan, prepared by Tectura P/L	
Feasibility Study Development Options Drawings: Options 1 & 2 Site/Floor Plans, prepared by Tectura P/L	
Feasibility Study Development Options 1 & 2: Shadow Diagram Drawings; Winter Solstice, Summer Solstice & Equinox, prepared by Tectura P/L	
Master Plan Options Drawings: Masterplan Options 1-14 & Typical 3 Bedroom Independent Living Unit Floor Plan;	

Master Plan Options Shadow Diagram Drawings: Winter Solstice, Summer Solstice & Equinox for Masterplan Options 8 & 9, prepared by Tectura P/L

Area Schedules for 72 Bed & 90 Bed Aged Care Facility & 30 Independent Living Units, prepared by Tectura P/L

Masterplan Option Assessment Matrix, prepared by Tectura P/L

St. Vincent de Paul Boy's Orphanage Conservation Management Plan, dated December 2007, prepared by Bryce Raworth P/L

Citation for Former St. Vincent's Boy's Orphanage Site, dated 11 June 2008, prepared by Heritage Victoria

1. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Introduction

The Victorian Government policy *A Fairer Victoria (2005)* recognised high land prices can be a barrier to the establishment of aged care residential services in areas of high need, especially in middle and inner metropolitan areas of Melbourne. The Aged Care Land Bank program is the outcome of the investigations into facilitating the development of not-for-profit residential aged care in areas of high need. The focus is on maintaining viable and accessible residential aged care (priority for high care) in the inner and middle suburban rings of Melbourne.

In the pilot stage of this program, the Victorian Government allocated \$4.8 million to assist the development of services at two sites. A further \$12.5 million has been committed by the government to support new proposals. The Land Bank program sources land, negotiates release of the land and gains in-principal support of local government planning authorities.

The Land Bank program mediates with government departments and agencies to deliver the sites to the Department of Human Services (DHS). Sites may be sold or leased to not-for-profit aged care providers, possibly at concessional rates, following an open tender. The program is based on provision of sites suitable for the development of services of around 90 places, which are to be used predominantly for the delivery of high care aged care services. Additional uses on sites, such as independent living units, would be allowable providing they are complementary to the primary use.

The site of the previous St Vincent's Boys Home, in Cecil Street South Melbourne, has been declared to be surplus to the requirements of the Victorian Government.

In accordance with the Aged Care Land Bank policy, it is to be considered as a possible suitable site for the development of a residential aged care facility by a not-for-profit aged care provider, based on a tender process.

This feasibility study report aims to inform DHS about the site, buildings, site functional layout for new aged care facilities, planning, heritage, car parking, height limitations and other likely development considerations. It provides 4 feasibility study design options derived from the 14 master plan conceptual site layout plans taking into consideration operational requirements of the four not-for-profit residential aged care providers consulted during the study and forecasts estimated probable development costs at today's prices.

The feasibility study report is to also provide information for subsequent Government consideration for inclusion of the site in the Aged Care Land Bank program and for offer by tender to not-for-profit providers under Land Bank processes. The outcomes of the feasibility study may be provided to eligible not-for-profit aged care providers who register an interest in the tender process, although the details of that tender process have yet to be finalised by DHS.

2. FEASIBILITY STUDY OVERVIEW

In May 2008 Tectura Architects were commissioned by the Department of Human Services as the Principal Consultant and Architect to prepare a feasibility study report for the potential of locating residential aged care facilities at the site of the former St Vincent de Paul Boys' Orphanage at Cecil Street, South Melbourne. The report is to provide information to Government to assist in determining the future use of the site. The Principal Consultant and Architect team consists of Tectura Architects, HLCD Heritage Architects and Plan Cost Australia Quantity Surveyors.

Service Plan

The Land Bank program has been used as the framework for this study. The not-for-profit organisations invited to tender for the site will be required to develop a Residential Aged Care Service Plan detailing the operations of their services as part of their tender to DHS.

Consultation

During the feasibility study four not-for-profit organisations were consulted and their facility requirements benchmarked with DHS aged care guidelines. These organisations are listed below;

- Royal Freemasons Homes of Victoria
- Sacred Heart Mission
- Southport Community Residential Home
- Brotherhood of St Lawrence

The Cecil Street aged care development design options are based on consultations with the four organisations and has sought to address their specific needs including the efficient recurrent cost operations with appropriate functional layouts based on the numbers of beds per wing and layout configurations which could be efficiently serviced for each of the organisations.

Briefed Requirements and Accommodation Area Schedules

Residential Aged Care:

Consultations with the four organisations during the development of the accommodation area requirements resulted in two separate area schedules for the proposed residential aged care facilities.

The Royal Freemasons Homes of Victoria and the Brotherhood of St Lawrence required a multiple of 12 bed wing configurations resulting in design options for a 72-bed development. The Southport Community Residential Home and the Sacred Heart Mission required a multiple of 15 bed wing configurations resulting in design options for a 90-bed development. The 72-bed proposal required a total Gross Floor Area of 3,517m² and the 90-bed proposal required a total Gross Floor Area of 4,581m².

Independent Living Units

Accommodation area requirements were also developed for 30 number Independent Living Units (I.L.U.s) potentially to be co-located on the site. Each of the master plan development design options indicate the location of the independent living units proposed for the site.

The Government site at Cecil Street contains existing heritage buildings which cover approximately 1,164m² of the site area leaving a potential “clear” site area of 3,474m² for new buildings and grounds.

Area schedules for the 30 independent living units consisting of a Gross Floor Area of 130m² per unit based on a mix of 3 bedrooms per unit or 2 bedrooms required a total Gross Floor Area of 5,004m².

The Feasibility Study reduced the I.L.U.s proposed for the site to 6 units due to the intensity of site development with the aged care facilities.

The Site, Town Planning Requirements & Permits

The site is Crown Land, granted by the Victorian Government on 12 October 1888 as a Crown Grant to Trustees to be used as a Roman Catholic Orphan Asylum which later became known as St Vincent de Paul Boys’ Orphanage.

The address is 231-241 Cecil Street, South Melbourne. The land is contained within an entire block and is bounded by Cecil, Napier, Raglan and Church Streets at South Melbourne.

The total land area is approximately 9,319m² where there’s approximately 5,400m² of existing building floor area, in one and two level buildings at the site.

The site is now to be divided approximately in half, as indicated in the attached Plan of Crown Allotment Title Plan Edition 1 TP 914515G between the Government and the Roman Catholic Church (Roman Catholic Trust Corporation) where MacKillop Family Services Limited occupy the main building fronting Cecil Street to the south-west.

The total size of the Government component of the site for the aged care development is approximately 4,638m² excluding a new access easement of 377m² dividing the site.

The site is within the Residential 1 zone of the Port Phillip Planning Scheme administered by the City of Port Phillip (CoPP). It has a Heritage Overlay (HO3 – South Melbourne, Albert Park, Middle Park and part of St Kilda).

On the 11 June 2008 Heritage Victoria advised of their intention to recommend the site for inclusion in the Victorian Heritage Register.

DHS commissioned a Conservation Management Plan for the site which has been completed. Tectura Architects with HLCD Architect and DHS have held discussions with Heritage Victoria representatives relating to the proposed registration and the proposed aged care use of the site. Heritage Victoria, Tectura Architects and HLCD Architects inspected the site. Please also refer to HLCD Heritage Architects advice further detailed in this report.

In addition to heritage requirements, car parking, street setbacks, site coverage density and height controls will need to be confirmed with the planning authority,

the City of Port Phillip and town planning, heritage permit and building permits obtained for developments at the site.

Master Plan Development Options

Fourteen development options were undertaken over the course of the feasibility study. All of the development options explore the possibility of a new multi-level building residential aged care development, together with the refurbishment of some of the existing heritage buildings. The building footprints vary for each proposed option and where car parking arrangements are proposed in the main to be on-street parking due to the intensity of development proposed at the site to house both residential aged care and independent living units, where there's insufficient land on natural ground for the required car parking. A detailed schedule noting the elements of each development option is attached to this report.

Shadow diagrams of some of the proposals indicating summer solstice, winter solstice and equinox have been included to provide an idea as to the level of light, shade and shadow which could be expected at the site for these developments.

There's however not a recommended or preferred Master Plan development option as each not-for-profit organisation will need to undertake their own detailed proposals for development at the site in consideration of their tender with DHS.

Four Feasibility Study Development Options

Following discussions with DHS and the not-for-profit sector over the fourteen Master Plan Development Options noted above, four Feasibility Study Development Options were subsequently prepared. The designs were based on consultations with DHS, the intensity of site development, car parking, building heights, setbacks, aged care resident internal and external environment and amenity together with the recommendations noted in the HLCD Heritage Architects Report relating to the potential demolition of existing buildings on the site. It was decided to reduce the I.L.U. numbers proposed from 30 to 6 units as this would have a greater chance of fulfilling the town planning permit and heritage requirements.

A description of each feasibility study option is as follows:

- *Option 1A:* 72-bed Residential Aged Care over 2 levels (36 beds per level)
6 Independent Living Units
On-site car parking for 19 cars (no basement)
- *Option 1B:* 72-bed Residential Aged Care over 2 levels (36 beds per level)
6 Independent Living Units
Basement car park for 30 cars + 9 on site car spaces
- *Option 2A:* 90-bed Residential Aged Care over 3 levels (30 beds per level)
6 Independent Living Units
On-site car parking for 22 cars (no basement)
- *Option 2B:* 90-bed Residential Aged Care over 3 levels (30 beds per level)

6 Independent Living Units

Basement car park for 30 cars + 13 on site car spaces

Shadow diagrams of the proposals indicating summer solstice, winter solstice and equinox have been included to provide an idea as to the level of light, shade and shadow which could be expected at the site for these developments.

There's however not a recommended or preferred feasibility study development option as each not-for-profit organisation will need to undertake their own detailed proposals for development at the site in consideration of their tender with DHS.

Programme

The suggested timeline to design, construct and commission residential aged care and independent living unit buildings on this site would be in the order of 4 to 5 years. There a number of significant planning and heritage issues to be resolved at the site and a detailed time and activity program would be required at the time of a specific project.

3. SITE CONDITIONS

The Site

The site is Crown Land, granted by the Victorian Government on 12 October 1888 as a Crown Grant to Trustees to be used as a Roman Catholic Orphan Asylum which later became known as St Vincent de Paul Boys' Orphanage.

The address is 231-241 Cecil Street, South Melbourne. The land is contained within an entire block and is bounded by Cecil, Napier, Raglan and Church Streets at South Melbourne and has an area of approximately 9,319m². There's approximately 5,400m² of existing building floor area, on one and two level buildings at the site.

The site is to be divided approximately in half as indicated in attached Plan of Crown Allotment Title Plan Edition 1 TP 914515G between the Government and the Roman Catholic Church (Roman Catholic Trust Corporation) where MacKillop Family Services Limited occupy the main building fronting Cecil Street to the south-west.

MacKillop Family Services Limited is a welfare agency under the auspice of the Catholic Archdiocese of Melbourne who currently utilise the main building for a number of offices and historical records storage area.

The total size of the Government component of the site for the aged care and independent living unit development is approximately 4,638m² excluding but adjacent to a new access easement dividing the original entirety of the site.

Proposed New Easement

The Plan of Crown Allotment Title Plan Edition 1 TP 914515G proposed easement is approximately 377m² and located along the west of the Government part of the site.

Site Heritage Overlay, Conservation Management Plan and Heritage Victoria

DHS commissioned Bryce Raworth Pty Ltd Heritage Architects who completed a Conservation Management Plan dated December 2007 for the site, which is included in this report.

The site also has a CoPP Planning Scheme Heritage Overlay HO3 – South Melbourne, Albert Park, Middle Park and part of St Kilda.

On the 11 June 2008 Mr. Ray Tonkin, Executive Director of Heritage Victoria wrote to the Roman Catholic Trust Corporation advising that in recognition of its cultural heritage significance the St Vincent de Paul Boys' Orphanage will be recommended for inclusion in the Victorian Heritage Register.

A final decision is expected to be made by the Heritage Council after the expiration of 60 days from the published notice in the Herald Sun newspaper dated 16 June 2008. The Heritage Victoria letter of 11 June 2008 is attached.

Briefing meetings and site inspections have taken place with Mr. Ray Osborne, Director, Operations, Heritage Victoria, HLCD Heritage Architects and Tectura Architects to review the proposed residential aged care development design options. HLCD Heritage Architects advice is included in this report.

Existing Buildings Conditions

All existing buildings at the Government part of the site are vacant and generally are in very poor or extremely poor condition. Visual site inspections were undertaken but detailed building fabric assessments or invasive tests were not carried out for the purposes of this report.

Subject to Heritage Victoria and/or City of Port Phillip Heritage Overlay considerations a detailed building fabric assessment will be required to gain a detailed understanding of the condition and framing of the existing structures and their sustainability for structural refurbishment and capacity for new use.

The four feasibility study development options propose to remove in whole or in part a number of buildings fronting Raglan and Church Streets, significantly refurbishing the building fronting Napier Street and demolishing the timber framed building along Church Street. The demolition and/or removal of buildings may not necessarily be permitted by Heritage Victoria and/or the City of Port Phillip.

Asbestos and Hazardous Materials Survey and Risk Assessment

A preliminary Part 6 of the Victorian Government Occupational Health and Safety (Asbestos) Regulations asbestos and hazardous materials survey was not undertaken for this feasibility study report. However, the two following Asbestos and Hazardous Materials Survey reports were previously undertaken by HLA-Envirosciences P/L for the Department of Treasury and Finance:

- Asbestos and Hazardous Materials Survey: Nominated Areas- 23 Cecil Street, 16th August 2007
- Asbestos and Hazardous Materials Survey: Allotment 2 Part 1- Main Building, 237 Cecil Street, 21st February 2008

These reports are historic and all tests would need to be undertaken for a specific project and therefore are not included in this report.

The HLA-Envirosciences P/L reports generally identified the presence of hazardous materials existing on the site, such as but not limited to;

- Asbestos-containing vinyl flooring
- Asbestos cement sheets
- Asbestos cement sheet shingles
- Asbestos cement flues
- Asbestos-containing vinyl tiles and adhesives
- Asbestos-containing pipework insulation
- Asbestos-containing electrical backing boards (assumed presence)
- Lead based paints
- Polychlorinated biphenyls in fluoro light fittings and capacitors
- Synthetic mineral fibre containing hot water tank insulation
- Synthetic mineral fibre containing ceiling tiles
- Ozone depleting substances in coolroom compressors
- Biological hazards (syringes)

A new asbestos and hazardous materials survey will need to be undertaken at the time of any proposal to develop the site.

Soil Conditions/ Contamination

Tectura Architects did not commission specialist geotechnical or geochemical engineers to undertake any invasive testing of soil conditions or contamination at the site for this report. However, a limited environmental site assessment report commissioned by the Victorian Department of Treasury and Finance was undertaken by SKM Consulting P/L in February 2008, titled "Limited Phase 2b Environmental Site Assessment: Mackillop Family Services Centre Report". This report is historic and all tests would need to be undertaken for a specific project and therefore is not included in this report.

In summary, the SKM report generally identified the following findings:

- An underground storage tank (UST) and associated infrastructure exists on the south-west corner of the site, once used for fuel storage. Further detailed investigation will be required to determine the effect of the tank on groundwater and soil in terms of contamination
- Given the residential zoning of the site, the site history indicates that the site has not been used for potentially contaminating uses in the past, other than fuel storage which is not primary use of the site
- Groundwater was identified on the site but no contamination was detected as a result of the fuel storage in the UST. However, further investigation will be required should the UST be removed from the site. Development proposals which may include basement level car parking will need to undertake detailed tests in determining ground water conditions at the site.
- Elevated concentrations of metals were identified in the fill material and natural soil profile of the site, however these levels are considered to present a low risk to the environment. Further investigation will be required to determine the risk of the contamination to a redevelopment of the site.

A detailed Environmental Site Assessment (ESA) would be required to assess the presence of contaminated materials and a Statutory Environmental Audit (SEA) may also be required in addition to the ESA.

Town Planning

The resolution of Town Planning/Heritage issues with the CoPP and Heritage Victoria are critical to any development at the site. A Town Planning/Heritage Permit will be required in order to obtain a Building Permit to construct and occupy the facilities.

Following preliminary discussions with the CoPP Town Planning Department regarding building height limits of the Feasibility Development Options, it was noted that being less than three storeys in height, the development options fall under Clause 55 of Rescode, which states "...the maximum building height should not exceed 9 metres...". Therefore, as this statement does not definitively restrict the building height to a maximum of 9 metres, there may be provision for an increased height limit. However, a strong justification must support the design on this basis. The existing buildings and surrounding building heights may also be taken into consideration in support of the proposal, however the existing brick chimney on Raglan Street may not be accepted as part of the existing height consideration.

Council also advised that the large site area may also contribute to supporting the proposed increased height limit.

Further consultation with Council will be required in relation to all Town Planning requirements.

- Building Height:

The Aged Care Land Bank Cecil Street site is located in a Residential 1 Zone (Section 2) with a permissible building height of 9 metres. A town planning permit is required for development of a property for an aged care facility within this residential zone. Modification of height controls on the site will need to be agreed with the City of Port Phillip as the proposed aged care buildings require a potential height of approximately 12-14 metres.

- Site Coverage/Density:

CoPP permissible site coverage is approximately 60% of site area. The Residential Aged Care facility with independent living units development options require a site coverage of approximately 57% to 63% of site area. The CoPP would need to agree to increase the permissible site coverage.

- Street Frontage Setbacks:

The CoPP Planning Scheme requires walls of buildings to be set back from streets at least the distance specified in the planning schedules for the zone. At the Government part of the site nearly all existing buildings are set near or very close to the boundary and siting and setbacks of new buildings will need to be confirmed with the CoPP.

- Urban Context:

The architecture of the building will need to take note of the City of Port Phillip requirements for streetscape and urban context. The land is within the South

Melbourne, Albert Park and Middle Park area where the architectural context is of 1 to 2 level low rise Edwardian, Victorian or Victorian Gothic architecture buildings.

- Carparking:

Residential Aged Care:

City of Port Phillip Planning Scheme considers an aged care facility as a residential development and the carparking requirement will be 1 for each lodging room. A dispensation may be supported by CoPP and the required spaces be based on staffing numbers at any one shift handover plus a “reasonable” number of visitor spaces. This may be in the order of 25 to 30 cars. On each of the proposals most carparks are proposed to be dedicated on-street parking as there's room for these along the four street frontages to the site but not enough room on natural ground level within the site. Traffic Engineering analysis reports will need to be undertaken and tested as part of a formal Town Planning permit application with the City of Port Phillip.

Independent Living Units (I.L.U.s):

City of Port Phillip Planning Scheme requires 1 space per dwelling to be provided on site. It may be possible with Traffic Engineering analysis and reporting to reduce this to 0.6 spaces per dwelling subject to the Town Planning process and City of Port Phillip agreement. Given the nature of the proposal, a dispensation may be supported by CoPP, as the assessment may largely consider whether there's adequate parking for staff and visitors.

Existing On-Street Car parks:

The following on-street car parking supply exists along the four streets to the entire site;

Cecil Street	2 hour angle parking	12
Napier Street	2 hour angle parking	33 (includes 1 disabled bay)
Raglan Street	½ hour parking;	31
Church Street	Unrestricted	16
Total:		92

Carparking requirements for residential aged care and independent living units development however needs to be resolved as part of the planning permit requirements with the City of Port Phillip. The Council policy is to retain all carparking on the site. The utilisation of on-street carparking will need their approval which will need to include extending the period of time able to be parked on-street such as with a residents parking permit. The development options are not able to contain all required cars on the site (without a basement carpark) as there's insufficient space at natural ground level to do so, therefore, detailed negotiations and traffic engineering reports will be required to be evidenced and agreed with the CoPP.

Regulatory Requirements

The proposed development will be required to address the relevant requirements of the Building Code of Australia and referenced Australian Standards and Codes of Practice, as well as obtain all permits required from relevant State and Local Government and Supply Authorities having jurisdiction over the site.

4. FOUR FEASIBILITY DEVELOPMENT OPTIONS DESCRIPTION

The below description of options the four Feasibility Study redevelopment options are based on consultations held with DHS, the Brotherhood of St Lawrence, Royal Freemasons Homes of Victoria, Southport Community Residential Home and the Sacred Heart Mission, following presentation and review of the previous fourteen Master Plan Development Options.

Feasibility Study Design Considerations and Assumptions

- The 72-bed Aged Care proposal comprises only single bedrooms with 60% dedicated ensuites and 40% shared ensuites.
- The 90-bed Aged Care proposal comprises only single bedrooms with 60% dedicated ensuites and 40% shared ensuites.
- The kitchen is based on a 'cook fresh kitchen' layout, with an area allocation of 110m².
- The extent of buildings proposed to be demolished are shown on the Site Demolition Plan attached to the Appendix of this report.
- According to the Victorian Heritage Register draft citation for the Former St. Vincent's Boys Orphanage site, all external and internal alterations carried out on the registered buildings will be subject to a planning permit.
- Re-use of the two-storey Napier Street building has been proposed in all four options, due to the HLCD Heritage Architects (and Heritage Victoria consultations) on site and the recommendation to retain the building. This building would require re-use / conversion internally, with facades and roofs maintained generally in their original form.
- The proposed easement through the middle of the site connecting Raglan and Napier Streets will be utilised to provide vehicle access to the site. On-site car parking spaces have been provided where possible.
- There are no vegetation controls on the site therefore all options assume trees could be removed or relocated.
- Setbacks have been maintained in the options from street frontages to keep in line with the existing buildings (eg. The Napier Street Theatre building setback from Church Street.)

Feasibility Study Development Option 1A

This option is based on a 2 storey aged care building with 72 beds – 36 beds distributed over each of the floors. It includes a total of 6 Independent Living Units (ILUs), which are to be refitted into the existing building on Napier Street. Eleven on-site car parking spaces are provided for the Aged Care facility including 2 disabled car spaces, while 7 car spaces have been provided on site for the ILUs. Main entry and drop-off zone is accessed via Church Street while deliveries for waste and linen utilise the proposed new easement at the west of the site. Existing buildings of heritage significance are retained as indicated on the Site Demolition Plan. All existing trees are removed. Existing timber building to be demolished. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

A potential car parking alternative for this development option proposes a basement car park for 30 car spaces, as indicated in Option 1B.

Advantages include:

- Retention of some existing significant heritage building fabric
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.
- Good internal and external environment for residents.

Disadvantages include:

- Some overshadowing towards western side of the site

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option may conform to height controls for town planning permit but needs to meet site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Feasibility Study Development Option 1B

This option is an iteration of Option 1A. It consists of a 2 storey aged care building with 72 beds – 36 beds distributed over each of the floors. It includes a total of 6 Independent Living Units (ILUs), which are to be refitted into the existing building on Napier Street. Included is a 30-car basement car park to be accessed from Raglan Street via the proposed easement in addition to 2 disabled spaces and 7 new ground level on-site car parking spaces for the ILUs. Main entry and drop-off zone is accessed via Church Street while deliveries for waste and linen utilise the proposed new easement at the west of the site. Existing buildings of heritage significance are retained as indicated on the Site Demolition Plan. All existing trees are removed. Existing timber building to be demolished. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Retention of some existing significant heritage building fabric
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.
- Provision of 37 on-site car parking spaces
- Good internal and external environment for residents.

Disadvantages include:

- Some overshadowing towards western side of the site

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option may conform to height controls for town planning permit, but needs to meet site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Feasibility Study Development Option 2A

This option is based on a 3 storey aged care building with 90 beds – 30 beds distributed over each of the floors. It includes a total of 6 Independent Living Units (ILUs), which are to be refitted into the existing building on Napier Street. Main entry and drop-off zone is accessed via Church Street while deliveries for waste and linen utilise the proposed new easement at the west of the site. Six car spaces including 2 disabled car spaces are accessed via the drop off zone off Church Street to the east of the site. Nine additional on site car spaces for Aged Care and 7 on site car spaces for ILUs are accessed via the proposed new easement at the west of the site. Existing buildings of heritage significance are retained as indicated on the Proposed Site Plan. All existing trees are removed. Existing timber building to be demolished. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Retention of some existing significant heritage building fabric
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.
- Outdoor courtyard areas provided and screened from neighbouring buildings and public view.
- Relatively good external environment for residents.

Disadvantages include:

- Some overshadowing towards southern side of the site
- Lack of adequate car spaces results in on-street parking.

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Feasibility Study Development Option 2B

This option is an iteration of Option 2A. It consists of a 3 storey aged care building with 90 beds – 30 beds distributed over each of the floors. It includes a total of 6 Independent Living Units (ILUs), which are to be refitted into the existing building on Napier Street. Main entry and drop-off zone is accessed via Church Street while deliveries for waste and linen utilise the proposed new easement at the west of the site. Existing buildings of heritage significance are retained as indicated on the Site Demolition Plan. All existing trees are removed. Existing timber building to be demolished. Each bedroom window to receive light and view. A basement car park for 30 car spaces is accessed by a ramp off the proposed new easement at the west of the site, in addition to 4 on site car spaces and 2 disabled car parks for the Aged Care facility. Seven car spaces have also been provided for the ILUs.

Advantages include:

- Retention of some existing significant heritage building fabric to Raglan and Napier Streets
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.
- Outdoor courtyard areas provided and screened from neighbouring buildings and public view.
- Basement car park allows for adequate car spaces (30 for Aged Care) while 7 spaces cater for the ILUs at ground level.
- Relatively good external environment for residents.

Disadvantages include:

- Some overshadowing towards southern side of the site

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

5. FOURTEEN MASTER PLAN DEVELOPMENT OPTIONS

The below master plan description of options informed the final Feasibility Study options and are based on the accommodation area schedules benchmarked to DHS residential aged care guidelines as well as consultations held with the Brotherhood of St Lawrence, Royal Freemasons Homes of Victoria, Southport Community Residential Home and the Sacred Heart Mission.

Design Considerations and Assumptions

- The 72-bed Aged Care proposals comprise only single bedrooms with 60% dedicated ensuites and 40% shared ensuites.
- The 90-bed Aged Care proposals comprise only single bedrooms with 60% dedicated ensuites and 40% shared ensuites.
- The kitchen is based on a 'cook fresh kitchen' layout, with an area allocation of 110m².
- The single-storey timber building to the east of the site will need to be demolished. If it is to be retained the proposed new aged care building and ILU areas will have to be reduced as there's insufficient site area for the entirety of the development to include aged care and ILU's as well as the timber building.
- According to the Victorian Heritage Register draft citation for the Former St. Vincent's Boys Orphanage site, all external and internal alterations carried out on the registered buildings will be subject to a planning permit.
- Re-use of buildings has been proposed in some options, due to lack of space on site. These buildings would require re-use / conversion internally, with facades and roofs maintained in their original form.
- The proposed easement through the middle of the site connecting Raglan and Napier Streets could be utilised to provide vehicle access to the site.

Some on-site car parking spaces may be incorporated along this access road where possible.

- There are no vegetation controls on the site therefore all options assume trees could be removed or relocated.
- Setbacks have been maintained in the options from street frontages to keep in line with the existing buildings (eg. The Napier Street Theatre building setback from Church Street.)

Option 1

This option is based on a 3 storey aged care building with 90 beds – 30 beds distributed over each of the floors. It includes a total of 10 Independent Living Units (ILUs), 6 of which are to be refitted into existing building on Napier Street and 4 to be refitted into the existing Raglan Street single storey building. 8 new onsite car parking spaces, Main entry, drop-off zone and delivery is accessed via the proposed new easement at the west of the site. All existing buildings of heritage significance are retained. All existing significant trees are retained. Existing timber heritage building to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Retention of trees
- Retention of existing significant buildings
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- Proximity of proposed building footprint to Church Street site boundary is an issue
- Separation from drop-off area and main entry
- Some overshadowing towards southern side of the site

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 2

This option is the same as option 1, except that in order to achieve an adequate setback from Church Street to maximise privacy, the entire building foot print has been shifted further west. The consequence of this is that all existing trees are removed. All existing masonry buildings of heritage significance are retained but the heritage timber building is removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Retention of existing significant buildings
- Setback achieved
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- Removal of trees
- Some overshadowing towards southern side of the site

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 3

This option is based on a 2 storey aged care building with 90 beds – 45 beds distributed over each of the floors. It accommodates no Independent Living Units. There is no provision for onsite car parking, Main entry, drop-off zone and delivery are accessed via Church Street. The Napier Street heritage building is retained and refitted, however all other existing buildings of heritage significance are removed. All existing trees are removed. Existing timber heritage building is to be relocated to the corner of Raglan and Church Streets. Courtyard and outdoor space will enable each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Accommodates entire 90 bed aged care facility over 2 levels.
- Timber building is able to be relocated on-site.
- Possibility to retain bulk of Raglan Street and Church Street façade as boundary wall

Disadvantages include:

- Requires demolition of existing significant trees
- Requires demolition of Raglan Street existing buildings
- Cluttered site/intense building footprint development
- Functionally does not work well
- Acceptable, relatively centralised amenities however distance from staff base to end of the unit is excessive.
- Courtyard may not receive direct sunlight due to being surrounded by a 2-storey wall.

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 4

This option is based on a 3 storey aged care building with 90 beds – 30 beds distributed over each of the floors. It includes a total of 10 Independent Living Units (ILUs), 6 of which are to be refitted into existing building on Napier Street and 4 to be refitted into the existing Raglan Street single storey building.

4 new onsite car parking spaces, Main entry, drop-off zone is accessed via Church Street; delivery and waste areas are accessed via the proposed new easement at the west of the site. All existing masonry buildings of heritage significance are retained. All existing trees are removed.

Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Good size outdoor spaces enable each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Retention of existing buildings.

Disadvantages include:

- Ineffective, decentralised amenity spaces in relation to bedrooms create a potentially difficult space to access/monitor from staff base.
- Minimal parking on site.
- Drop off zone located from Church Street which may be too narrow.
- Removal of trees.
- Some overshadowing towards southern side of the site

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 5

This option is based on a 2 storey aged care building with a total of 90 beds – 45 beds distributed over each of the two floors. It accommodates 6 Independent Living Units. There's provision for 8 onsite car parking spaces, Main entry and drop-off zone are accessed via Church Street; deliveries and waste is accessed via the proposed new easement.

The Napier and Raglan Street masonry heritage buildings are retained and refitted with part of the single level building at Raglan Street removed. The three largest existing trees are retained. The existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Accommodates entire 90 bed aged care facility over 2 levels.
- Re-fits and utilises all existing buildings, façade wall can be retained.
- Three largest trees are retained.
- Separation of main entry and deliveries / waste.
- No severe overshadowing

Disadvantages include:

- Ineffective, decentralised amenity spaces create a potentially difficult space to monitor/access bedrooms from staff base.
- Requires partial demolition of one of the Raglan Street existing buildings.
- Cluttered/intense building/site layout

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 6

This option is based on a 2 storey aged care building with 90 beds – 45 beds distributed over each of the floors. It accommodates 6 Independent Living Units. There is provision for 8 onsite car parking spaces. Main entry and drop-off zone are accessed via Church Street; delivery and waste removal via the proposed new easement. All existing masonry buildings of heritage significance are retained and refitted. All existing significant trees are retained. Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Abundant outdoor space ensures each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Accommodates entire 90 bed aged care facility over 2 levels.
- All existing trees are retained
- All of existing masonry buildings of heritage significance are retained
- No severe overshadowing

Disadvantages include:

- Cluttered building footprint.
- Building footprint extends to Church Street site boundary.
- Ineffective, amenities spaces being off centred create a very difficult space to monitor from staff base due to distance to bedrooms.

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 7

This option is the same as option 6, except that in order to achieve an adequate setback from Church Street, the entire building foot print has been shifted west. The consequence of this is that all the existing trees are now removed, as well as a portion of the heritage single storey masonry building. All other existing masonry buildings of heritage significance are retained. Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Retention of existing significant buildings
- No severe overshadowing

Disadvantages include:

- Minimal parking on site.
- Drop off zone located from Church Street may be too narrow.
- Ineffective, amenities spaces being not central creates a difficult space to monitor bedrooms from staff base due to distances.
- Removal of trees

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 8

This option is based on a 3-storey building with 90 beds – 30 beds distributed on each of the three floors. It also includes a total of 30 independent living units (I.L.U) – 6 of these to be re-fitted in the Napier Street building and 24 of these are to be located in the 4-storey building to the south of the site (distributing 6 units per floor). There is a visitor entry and drop-off from proposed easement to the west of the site. Delivery and waste removal is located from Church Street. There is no proposed car parking on the site but it is assumed a 0.6 car space per I.L.U to be approved by the CoPP as on-street parking.

The Raglan Street masonry buildings of heritage significance are removed including the façade to Raglan St. Existing trees are removed. Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- 4 storey I.L.U. building is to the south of site which is better for overshadowing
- Aged care layout works well functionally
- Deliveries and kitchen from Church Street
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- 3 storey aged care building
- Separate I.L.U. building would require an extra lift/stair core
- Requires complete removal of Raglan Street existing buildings
- Some overshadowing towards southern side of the site

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 9

This option is based on a 3-storey building with 90 beds – 30 beds distributed on each of the three floors. It includes a total of 30 independent living units (I.L.U) – 6 of these to be re-fitted in the Napier Street building and 24 of these to be located in the 4-storey building to the north of the site (distributing 6 units per floor).

Space is freed up for aged care beds at south of the site. Visitor entry and drop off, delivery and waste removal is located from Raglan St. There is no proposed car parking on the site but is assumed to have 0.6 Car spaces per I.L.U for on-street parking to be agreed with CoPP.

Bulk of the existing masonry heritage building façade to Raglan St and Church St is retained. Existing trees are removed from the site. Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- 30 I.L.U.'s share the one lift/stair core
- Having the I.L.U.'s at the north of the site frees up a larger footprint towards the south for the aged care building
- Aged care has main entry and drop-off from Raglan Street
- Functionally works well
- Deliveries and kitchen from Church Street
- Potential to retain much of the existing façade
- Potential to refit Raglan Street buildings rather than demolish them
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- 4 storey I.L.U. building towards the North of site means increased overshadowing
- 3 storey aged care building
- Requires significant portion of Raglan Street buildings and façade for main entry.

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 10

This option is based on a 3-storey building with 72 beds – 36 beds distributed on each of two floors. It includes a total of 24 independent living units (I.L.U) – these are to be located in the 4-storey building to the north of the site (distributing 6 units per floor). Napier Street building is to be demolished. There is a visitor entry and drop-off from proposed easement to the west of the site.

Delivery and waste removal is located on Church Street. 10 car parking spaces are proposed on site, 0.6 car spaces per I.L.U is assumed to be on-street parking. The existing masonry heritage building façade is removed along Raglan St. Existing trees removed. Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- 4 storey I.L.U. to south of site which is better for overshadowing
- Some provision for on site car parking
- 2 storey aged care building
- Functionally works well
- Deliveries and kitchen from Church Street
- Good, centralised amenities links into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- Requires demolition of the heritage Napier Street building and is therefore not viable.

- Requires complete removal of Raglan Street existing buildings and probably is not viable.
- 3-storey Aged Care facility will potentially overshadow the lower levels of the 4-storey I.L.U building on the southern part of the site.

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 11

This option is based on a 3-storey building with 72 beds – 36 beds distributed on each of two floors.

It includes a total of 30 independent living units (I.L.U) – 6 of these to re-fitted in the Napier Street building and 24 of these are to be located in a new 4-storey building to the north of the site (distributing 6 units per floor). Visitor entry and drop off is located from Raglan St. Delivery and waste removal from Church St. There is no proposed car parking on the site but is assumed to be 0.6 car spaces per I.L.U for on-street parking. The existing masonry heritage façade to Raglan St and Church St are retained. Existing trees removed. Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- 30 I.L.U.'s share the one lift/stair core
- Having the I.L.U.'s at the north of the site frees up a larger footprint towards the south for the residential aged care building
- Aged care has main entry and drop-off from Raglan Street
- Functionally works well
- Delivery and kitchen from Church Street
- Potential to refit Raglan Street buildings rather than demolish them
- 2 storey aged care building
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- 4 storey I.L.U. building towards the North of site means increased overshadowing
- Requires demolition of significant portions of Raglan Street buildings and façade for main entry.
- Cluttered site

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 12

This option is based on a 3-storey building with 72 beds – 24 beds distributed on each of the three floors. It includes a total of 30 independent living units (I.L.U) – 6 of these to re-fitted in the Napier Street building and 24 of these are to be located in the 4-storey building to the south of the site (distributing 6 units per floor).

Visitor entry and drop off from proposed easement to west of site. Delivery and waste removal is located from Church St. There is no proposed car parking on the site but is assumed to have 0.6 car spaces per I.L.U for on-street parking.

The existing masonry heritage buildings façade is removed along Raglan St.

Existing trees are removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- 4 storey I.L.U. building is to the south of site which is better for overshadowing
- Aged care layout works well functionally
- Deliveries and kitchen from Church Street
- Good, centralised amenities links into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- 3 storey aged care building
- Separate I.L.U. building would require an extra lift/stair core
- Requires complete removal of Raglan Street existing buildings

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 13

This option is based on a 3-storey building with 90 beds – 30 beds distributed on each of the three floors. It includes a total of 30 independent living units (I.L.U) – 6 of these to re-fitted in the Napier Street building and 24 of these are to be located in the 4-storey building to the west of the site (distributing 6 units per floor). Visitor entry and drop off from proposed easement at west of site.

Delivery and waste removal is from the proposed easement. There is no proposed car parking on the site but is assumed to have 0.6 car spaces per I.L.U for on-street parking. The existing masonry heritage building to Raglan St and Church St are removed with retention of most of the façade only. Existing trees removed. Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Functionally adequate
- Potential for most of the Raglan Street façade to be retained.
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- Separate I.L.U. building would require an extra lift/stair core
- 3 storey aged care building which means substantial overshadowing of I.L.U.'s.
- Main entry for aged care residents and deliveries from proposed easement

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

Option 14

This option is based on a 3-storey building with 90 beds – 30 beds distributed on each of the three floors. It includes a total of 24 independent living units (I.L.U) – 6 of these to re-fitted in the Napier Street building and 18 of these are to be located in the 4-storey building to the south of the site (distributing 6 units per floor).

Visitor entry and drop off from proposed easement from west of site. Delivery and waste removal is located from Church St. ILU undercroft carparking located on site. Bulk of the existing masonry heritage buildings to Raglan St and Church St are removed with retention of most of the façade only. Existing trees removed. Existing timber heritage building is to be removed. Each bedroom window to receive light and view.

Advantages include:

- Aged care layout works well functionally
- Deliveries and kitchen from Church Street
- On site car parking
- No severe overshadowing on site
- Good, centralised amenities link into each other with relatively short distance from staff base to bedrooms.

Disadvantages include:

- 3 storey aged care building
- Only 24 No. total I.L.U.'s
- Separate I.L.U. building would require an extra lift/stair core
- Requires removal of Raglan Street existing buildings other than façades

NOTE: This option is subject to issues that need to be resolved in order to proceed. The option currently exceeds height controls for town planning permit, site coverage and car parking requirements, however these issues may be negotiated with the City of Port Phillip.

6. AUTHORITIES

Regulatory Issues

The proposed development will be required to address the relevant requirements of the Building Code of Australia and referenced Australian Standards and Codes of Practice, as well as statutory requirements of relevant State and Local Government and Supply Authorities having jurisdiction over the site. The relevant authorities are noted below.

City of Port Phillip	Municipal Authority, Planning Permit including Council Heritage Overlay. Traffic, Carparking, Access and Building Permit.
Heritage Victoria	Heritage Permit – A Heritage Permit will be required.
Telstra	Telecommunications

Citipower	Electricity
Multinet	Gas
Melbourne Water	Stormwater / Water Supply & Sewer Mains

The specific requirements of all relevant authorities will need to be determined and appropriate responses made during the design and construction phases of the project.

7. ENVIRONMENTALLY SUSTAINABLE DESIGN

Energy and Environmental Objectives

The residential aged care development could be designed with a view to achieve minimum energy consumption and reduce greenhouse gases whilst creating a better environment for residents, staff and visitors.

Environmentally sustainable design principles are important aspects in achieving the above conditions through site orientation and design features such as water recycling, low energy consumption building services systems, acoustic and vibration performance, natural light, solar energy, natural ventilation, the specification of materials where possible from renewable resources, water harvesting and re-use. These design features will reduce the running costs of the building and produce less impact on the environment.

8. APPENDICES

The following documents listed below are included as appendices to this report:

- Heritage Architects Report prepared by HLCD Heritage Architects
- Existing Conditions Site/Ground Floor Plan, prepared by Tectura P/L
- Existing Site Conditions Photos, prepared by Tectura P/L
- Draft Title Plan for Cecil Street Site
- Feasibility Study Development Options: Proposed Demolition Site Plan, prepared by Tectura P/L
- Feasibility Study Development Options Drawings: Options 1 & 2 Site/Floor Plans, prepared by Tectura P/L
- Feasibility Study Development Options 1 & 2: Shadow Diagram Drawings; Winter Solstice, Summer Solstice & Equinox, prepared by Tectura P/L
- Master Plan Options Drawings: Masterplan Options 1-14 & Typical 3 Bedroom Independent Living Unit Floor Plan;
- Master Plan Options Shadow Diagram Drawings: Winter Solstice, Summer Solstice & Equinox for Masterplan Options 8 & 9, prepared by Tectura P/L
- Area Schedules for 72 Bed & 90 Bed Aged Care Facility & 30 Independent Living Units, prepared by Tectura P/L
- Master Plan Option Assessment Matrix, prepared by Tectura P/L
- St. Vincent de Paul Boy's Orphanage Conservation Management Plan, dated December 2007, prepared by Bryce Raworth P/L
- Citation for Former St. Vincent's Boy's Orphanage Site, dated 11 June 2008, prepared by Heritage Victoria